



**ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

**FEBRUARY 1, 2024
6:30 PM**

- 1. CALL TO ORDER:**
 - a. The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Damasco at 6:34 pm.
- 2. ROLL CALL:**
 - a. Present: Damasco, Kahlon, Shoaito, Wahhab, Wood
 - b. Absent: Acosta, Sese
 - c. Staff Present: Karin Schnaider, Assistant City Manager
Stephanie Reyna-Hiestand, Assistant Director of Utilities
Bill Dean, Assistant Director of Development Services
Genevieve Federighi, Associate Planner
 - d. Recorded by: Carla Sorich, Executive Assistant
- 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE** - Led by Commissioner Wood.
- 4. ITEMS FROM THE AUDIENCE** - None.
- 5. CONSENT ITEMS** - None.
- 6. ACTIONABLE ITEMS**
 - 6.A CONDUCT A PUBLIC MEETING TO SOLICIT COMMENTS ON THE RECIRCULATED DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT CHAPTERS FOR THE TRACY COSTCO DEPOT ANNEX PROJECT**

Public comment: None

Commissioners each shared their comments and questions on the RDEIR. Staff compiled a list of comments (C), clarifying questions (Q), and recommendations (R) to include in the ESC letter to Planning Division.

Draft EIR Page 22: (Key Findings)

- Net Increase of a Criteria Pollutant (Impact 3.3-1) and Cumulative Net Increase (Impact 3.3-2).
 - Q. What specific criteria pollutant is expected to increase, and what are the potential health and environmental impacts associated with this increase?
 - R. The Project should address and mitigate the net increase in criteria pollutants and their cumulative effects on air quality.
- Cumulative Impact on Agricultural Resources (Impact 4.4)
 - Q. How does the cumulative impact affect the long-term viability of agricultural resources in the region?

- Q. Will there be runoff associated with this project?
- Q. Will there be impacts to the water sources nearby?
- R. The Project implement strategies to offset or mitigate the cumulative impact on agricultural resources and water sources.

- Tree Canopy and Noise Reductions
 - Q. Are the tree canopy requirements referred to in the Costco Letter equivalent to the Urban Forest Management Plan (UFMP)?
 - Q. Where are the neighborhoods that are impacted by noise and how will this measure resolve those impacts.
 - R. Make sure that tree canopy requirements are consistent with the Urban Forest Management Plan (UFMP)
 - R. The tree layering should form a landscaping barrier that addresses noise and the overall tree canopy.

- Landscaping
 - R. All landscaping should be native plants that are non-invasive for Tracy, CA.

- LED Lighting
 - Q. Will the proposed energy efficiency lighting installed be LED?

- Organic Waste Reduction SB1383
 - Q. What measures specifically will be taken for compliance with organic waste reduction?
 - Q. Will there be a food waste bin for composting?
 - R. Compliance with SB1383 for businesses

- Electric Vehicle and Bicycle
 - Q. Will there be Electric Bicycle storage and charging onsite?
 - R. Provide charging stations for electric bicycles.
 - Q. How many and locations of electric bicycle parking?
 - R. Provide traffic calming mitigation that includes bicycle safety and encourages the use of bicycle travel offsite.
 - R. Provide storage facilities for electric bicycles close to entrance of facility.

- Onsite Food – Remaining onsite during mealtime
 - Q. Will there be nutritional considerations for food in vending machines as well as by vendors onsite?
 - Q. Will there be alternative sources of food which would encourage employees to not travel during mealtimes?
 - Q. Will there be both indoor and outdoor seating?
 - R. Provide additional options for food choices including outside vendors (food trucks) and provide outdoor seating.

- Electric Vehicle Charging Stations
 - Q. Why are they only located near ADA and Van Pool parking?
 - Q. Is there consideration to add additional EV Chargers in the future?
 - R. Give electric vehicles privileged parking and provide charging stations near the entrance.

- Costco Letter #41-47, 51,54-55
 - Q. Are there existing City ordinances or policies in place that provide standards for items regulated by the SJVAPCD?
 - Q. Could staff provide a side-by-side comparison of City Ordinances and SJVAPCD regulations and policies?
 - R. Provide language that requires compliance at a higher standard with Air Quality Standards by either the City ordinance or SJVAPCD, whichever is the stricter or higher and most current.

- Construction – prior to and during
 - Q. Do you provide a landscaping example plan prior to permits being issued for construction?
 - Q. Is it possible to include exhibits showcasing this in the RDEIR?
 - Q. Dust control by higher standards of either City Ordinance or SJVSPCD?
 - Q. Do you revegetate the soil after construction?
 - Q. Do you comply with SWPPP requirements?
 - R. Compliance with SWPPP requirements.

- Rule 9510
 - C. Please provide a summary of Rule 9510.
 - R. Costco should comply with the most current emission standards.

- Overall compliance
 - Q. How will the mitigation strategies and project features be monitored to ensure compliance?

- Section 3.3 “Air Quality”
 - C. The RDEIR states that the NOx emissions will exceed the SJVAPCD Rule 9510 by more than fifty percent (50%) in its Operational Project Generated Emissions. Mitigation measure 3.3-1 stipulates the use of trucks that have a 2010 model year or newer engines that meet the CARBs 2010 engine emission standards.
 - Q. When would the City begin to enforce this new measure for compliance?
 - R. Given that there is a new CARB standard, the Low NOx Heavy Duty Omnibus Regulation, released in August 2020 and in effect 2024, it is strongly recommended that Costco be held to this new higher standard.

- GHG Reductions
 - Q. What are Costco’s plans to continue to reduce GHG emissions at this site post2020, per CARBs Strategies in the sectors of energy, transportation, water and wastewater management?
 - R. Strongly recommended that Costco implement the suggestions that are included on page 112 of the RDEIR.

- Agricultural Mitigation Measures
 - Q. Regarding the loss of “Prime Farmland” as a result of this project, the RDEIR mentions the City’s Agricultural Mitigation Fee program and the SJMSCP required ag per-acre fees. How much is Costco paying to the City and to the SJMSCP?
 - Q. How, specifically, will the City use the fees that are collected?
 - Q. What specific conservation easements on Ag Land will be purchased and what will be done on those lands?

- Impact 4.14 – Cumulative Noise
 - Q. What is being done to reduce the number of trucks at night and the noise that is generated by them both traveling and idling?
 - R. It is strongly recommended that Costco build a noise barrier/sound wall and implement other practices to reduce nighttime noise to surrounding residences.

- Impact 4.17 – Vehicle Miles Traveled
 - Q. Why is it so difficult to measure the effect of travel demand management?
 - R. Strongly recommended that Costco implement further strategies as outlined in Kimley/Horne study report beginning on page 644 of the RDEIR and include items a through g of that report which are:
 - a. Coordinating with the City transit agency to put in a transit stop and provide a bus route to this are, which already has other industrial hubs
 - b. Provide transit subsidies to use this local transit
 - c. Implement a Travel Behavior Change program to educate and incentivize employees to change their travel behaviors
 - d. Use promotions and marketing to promote awareness of the TDM strategies and have an on-site coordinator to monitor the Travel Behavior Change program
 - e. Implement an Emergency Ride Home program for employees using alternative transportation who need a ride home at times that transportation is not provided
 - f. Offer telecommuting and alternative work schedules where possible, such as a Four-Ten work schedule that results in 20% weekly VMT reduction, 10% trip reduction and 15% VMT reduction
 - g. On-site childcare to remove the need to drive a child to daycare at a separate location

- Parking Requirements
 - Q. Page 705 of the RDEIR is a diagram of the parking proposed at the Project. Given that the estimated number of employees is 250 and that the mitigation strategies include reducing the number of parking spaces to the minimum, why are there 611 parking slots?
 - Q. If this is due to the City minimum, what is that number?
 - Q. What studies were performed to determine the actual mitigation of limited parking?
 - Q. Does the study show that the mitigation actually provides less miles traveled?
 - R. It is strongly recommended that Costco reduce the number of parking spots for employees and one guest.

- Ride Share Program
 - Q. How will Costco implement this?
 - R. Work with City to make this a bus stop. Provide Tracer credit. Provide shuttle service with electric bus.
 - R. Costco provide its own shuttle service with electric vehicle.

- Solar PV
 - Q. What study(s) were done on the carbon impacts for the addition of solar?
 - Q. How much of the roof space is being utilized and what is the portion of their energy that will be mitigated by solar installation and collection?

- Mobile TDM – Costco Mitigations

- Q. #15 and #16, are these measures for offsite or onsite?
Q. #21-23, how will this become a mitigation measure? How will it be implemented and enforced to resolve the impact?
Q. #24 and 26, how will this be enforced onsite? How will this become a mitigation measure and how will you show it resolved the impact?
Q. #32 Truck Idling - What studies were conducted that show this mitigation will result in measurable reductions in noise? How will it be enforced?
Q. #36 how will this be implemented and how will it be enforced? Who has oversight to ensure compliance?
Q. #40 - Construction of idling of vehicles: how will this become a mitigation measure? Who monitors this during construction?
Q. #50 - Speed: how will this become a mitigation measure? Who monitors this to show this mitigation is met? Is this onsite or offsite?
Q. #53 – Noise mitigation during construction. Need to consider safety over noise reduction for backup truck sounds. How will this mitigation measure be implemented and who will enforce it?
Q. #28 what is the mitigation measure to facilitate this change. How do they see implementation?
R. Use Hydrogen power trucks with fuel from hydrogen power plant in Tracy.

ACTION: Motion was made by Commissioner Wood and seconded by Commissioner Kahlon to accept the changes as provided for public comment on the RDEIR and amendments to the official comment letter from the ESC. All in favor; passed and so ordered. (4,0,0)

Approve -Wood, Kahlon, Damasco, Wahhab
Oppose - None
Abstain - None

7. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS - None

8. STAFF ITEMS - None

9. ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION

Commissioner Kahlon thanked staff for their patience and expertise as the Commission worked through their comments on the RDEIR.

Commissioner Wood and Vice Chair Damasco also thanked staff.

10. ADJOURNMENT – Vice-Chair Damasco adjourned the meeting at 8:48 PM.

ACTION: Motion was made by Vice Chair Damasco and seconded by Commissioner Wahhab to adjourn the meeting. All in favor, passed and so ordered. (4,0,0)

Approve -Wood, Kahlon, Damasco, Wahhab
Oppose - None
Abstain - None